Municipal Governance and Development Community
Solution Exchange Afghanistan

Municipal Governance and Development Community
Consolidated Reply

**Query: Citizen Engagement in Municipal Governance - Experiences**

Compiled by Mohammad Naseer Hamidi, Community Facilitator and Nematullah Haidari, Research Specialist

**Issue Date: 07 January 2013**

From Abdul Baqi Popal, General Director of Municipal Affairs, Independent Directorate of Local Governance

**Posted 11 December 2012**

The Independent Directorate of Local Governance (IDLG) is responsible for Provincial and District municipal administrations in Afghanistan, in addition to its other key functions. In my capacity as the General Director of Municipal Affairs at IDLG, I feel privileged with the launch of a dedicated Community on Municipal Governance and Development in Solution Exchange Afghanistan, connecting us with urban professional and practitioners for pragmatic solutions to municipal issues. Solution Exchange is a great initiative that will significantly contribute to the knowledge needs of Afghanistan in the transition and transformation processes and to our efforts to implement the Sub-National Governance Policy and the National Priority Program (NPP) on Local Governance.

Further to this, I am delighted to be posting the very first query to the Community members, to seek your perspectives on an important issue currently facing GDMA/IDLG.

An important role of IDLG is to work on various regulations, bills, guidelines and manuals to ensure the effective implementation of national priority programs. We believe that citizen engagement in municipal governance is an important consideration to help ensure wide consultation, better buy-in, engagement and more effective programmes in cities. Citizen engagement here can take many forms, such as consultation processes, citizen oversight, or taking on specific governance responsibilities.

If the Directorate were more aware of approaches that practitioners have used to promote citizen engagement in these areas, we could ensure that they are considered in the policies and rules we are formulating that relate to ways municipalities are governed or applied as possible models.
To this end, can those of you working in Afghanistan municipalities, and elsewhere, share with me and our Community colleagues any good examples of citizen engagement in municipal governance? What kind of success have these experiences had, and what are some of the constraints that we should be addressing while formulating policies, strategies and regulations?

Responses were received, with thanks, from

1. Nasir Ahmad Salehzada, UNDP- Afghanistan Sub-National Governance Program (UNDP-ASGP), Kabul
2. Roobika Noori, Regional Afghan Municipalities Program for Urban Populations (RAMP-UP) North, Mazar-e-Sharif
3. Ahmad Shahir Salehi, UNDP-ASGP, Herat
4. Engr. Mohammad Yasin Hilal, Kabul Municipality, Kabul
5. Engr. Zabihullah Issa, RAMP-UP North, Mazar-e-Sharif
6. Nidhi Batra, the World Bank and Society for Participatory Research in Asia, New Delhi India
7. Ahmad Zubair Fattahi, UNDP, Kabul
8. Khesraw Qaderi, National Democratic Institute (NDI), Mazar-e-Sharif
9. Enayatullah Mujaddidi, Swedish Committee for Afghanistan, Mazar-e-Sharif
10. Mohammad Amin Tokhi, Kunar Governor’s Office, Asa’ad Abad-Kunar
11. Abdul Habib Bahar, Bazarak Municipality, Panjsheer
12. Sayed Hafeezullah Rohany, UNDP-ASGP, Mazar-e-Sharif
13. Amanullah Faqiree, UNDP-ASGP, Kabul
14. Haji Mohammad Gul Seddique, United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan (UNAMA), Farah
15. Ahmad Sayed Faizi, General Directorate of Municipal Affairs- Independent Directorate of Local Affairs (GDMA-IDLG), Kabul
16. Abdul Satar Seerat, UNDP-ASGP, Kabul
17. Mohammad Naseer Hamidi, UNDP, Kabul (Response 1; Response 2)
18. Hamidullah Afghan, IDLG, Kabul
19. Zabihullah Habib Afrooz, National Environmental Protection Agency (NEPA), Kabul
20. David Stonehill, USAID, Kabul
21. Napoleon De Sagun, Individual Consultant, Manila Philippines
23. Nader Yama, IDLG, Kabul
24. Alhaj Mohammad Salim Taraki, Herat Municipality, Herat

Further contributions are welcome!

Summary of Responses
Comparative Experiences
Related Resources
Responses in Full

Summary of Responses
For the Community’s first Query, posed by the General Director for Municipal Administration seeking member experiences on citizen engagement in Municipal governance, 24 members offered national and international experiences on consultation processes, citizen oversight, and involvement in governance responsibilities. Several experiences within Afghanistan were from the major donor-sponsored initiatives such as the ASGP, supported by UNDP or RAMP-UP, sponsored by USAID, but several other experiences, as well as international experiences, also featured citizen engagement prominently, demonstrating the value of knowledge-sharing beyond the existing channels available to government.

**Consultation processes.** Contributors provided excellent cases of municipal governments consulting with their constituents in planning, law/policy-making and budgeting processes. RAMP-UP has encouraged formation of Project Advisory Boards, and example was provided from Mazar-e-Sharif. RAMP-UP also introduced municipal budget hearings and mid-term reviews in the North and Northeast Municipalities as a way of getting feedback on priorities and implementation progress, and promoting buy-in and ownership. In Kunduz and Mazar-e-Sharif, ASGP introduced advisory groups consisting of youths, women, private sector and civil society organizations. In these and other cities, youths were consulted in law drafting. ASGP has also encouraged town hall meetings in the North and Northeast. One participant mentioned the World Bank’s experience with Participatory Budgeting as being appropriate for Afghanistan.

**Citizen oversight.** A member offered examples from Herat for enhancing citizen oversight of government activities. They set up a “Scientific Advisory Board” with broad representation for reviewing urban services, and introduced a series of publicly accessible forums for reporting progress such as town hall meetings, newsletters, websites, radio and TV programs, and call-in shows. Facebook was being used by Sheberghan. Examples from India included budget hearings and other accountability and consultation forums, and the concept of Citizen Report Card.

**Involvement in governance responsibilities.** ASGP has been engaged in creating community-based governance structures at the Nahial and Gozar levels, whereby elected representatives prepare participatory development plans and take on responsibilities, such as waste collection and disposal in Mazar-e-Sharif. In Kabul, elected Community Development Councils plan, implement and maintain small infrastructure projects. Other examples provided of community development organizations managing service delivery were from Orangi town of Karachi, Pakistan, where a community-based technical resource center provides cheap engineering services to the poor. Cases from Bangalore, India and Mazar-e-Sharif illustrated volunteer services by interns in municipal governance. A contributor cited Khuda Ki Basti, in Karachi Pakistan, as a good example of an NGO-managed settlement. Other examples mentioned included a slum upgrading committees in Rajasthan, Chhattisgarh and Bihar, India, an Elders’ Committee for City Greening in Farah and Municipal Economic Development Committees in Herat and Mazar-e-Sharif.

In addition to these three dimensions, respondents provided others. Herat, Mazar-e-Sharif and Kunduz were encouraging civic education and responsibility through the education system, creating student-led governance structures in schools and universities. An NGO in India, the Society of Participatory Research in Asia (PRIA), uses campaigns to promote citizen engagement and awareness in areas such as voting, birth registration, access to sanitation and other interventions. One contributor recommended an analytical tool for civic engagement, identifying ten specific components of community dynamics of empowerment and governance, which was applied to Philippines in the mid 90s. Some members suggested role modeling as an effective tool to promote a change, citing the case of Jhunjhunu India, where a community-led door to door garbage collection effort was subsequently adopted by the municipality, and the case of Kabul, where people immediately reacted and implemented the role modeled.
**Key success factors.** The experiences provided suggested that citizen engagement is most successful when municipalities are sincere about reaching out and encouraging participation through effective communication, increasing awareness and understanding of civic duties and citizen concerns. Other factors cited were transparency of information, delegating decision-making to those closest to the results, and making incentives available such as financial resources. Tapping the youth and engaging citizens early on in civic responsibilities improved understanding and engagement. Finally, Municipalities engaging citizens in all three dimensions – consultation, oversight and engagement in responsibilities – appeared to have greater success in each, since it offered both implementation opportunities, continual feedback on performance, and buy-in for the outcomes. One participant referred to the International Association for Public Participation, which has developed a “public involvement spectrum” featuring an “engage-collaborate-empower” continuum.

**Challenges.** One issue cited was the resources and effort required to mobilize and sustain citizen engagement, particularly given the limited awareness that exists in most municipalities presently. Community responsibility in public works planning and construction can result in maintenance problems due to non-standard designs. Communication can be hindered by the lack of internet connectivity. A lack of rules and guidelines on citizen engagement constrained actions. This last point related to a wider challenge of incorporating greater transparency, responsiveness and effectiveness into operating procedures for Municipalities. Increased interest in a wider reform effort was suggested as a logical outcome of the current citizen engagement initiatives. It could include several of the suggestions made, such as institutionalizing citizen consultation bodies (Gozar organizations, Municipal Advisory Boards), engaging the Ministry of Education for student participation, and promoting role modeling of innovative approaches.

Gauging from the examples provided, many opportunities for citizen engagement exist in Afghanistan and elsewhere. Where successful, results can be shown to promote transparency and more effective governance. But the query also leads to another promising dimension, still to be explored – namely, the cost-effectiveness of citizen engagement, and whether it can effectively reduce the costs of operating municipalities through improved oversight, more cost-effective services, and less budgetary investments.

**Comparative Experiences**

**Mazar-e-Sharif**

*From Sayed Hafeezullah Rohany, UNDP-ASGP, Mazar-e-Sharif*

**Nahia Council for Mazar**

ASGP-UNDP initiated a Nahia Council for Mazar consisting of representatives from all Gozar organizations, the Municipality Nahia Office, Civil Society, Schools and Police. The Council prepared the Nahia’s profile and development plan. The result was more coordination among Gozars and a knowledge sharing hub.

**Advisory Groups**

Mazar-e-Sharif created advisory groups to enhance good governance by identifying concerns and needs and solicit suggestions from different levels of society. Groups formed were for women, civil society and academics. The latter helped the municipality to improve its Buildings Strategic Plan.
Management and Oversight Committee
Mazar-e-Sharif created city technical management and oversight committee. Since creation, it has contributed to synergy development between various urban players and to increase municipal control on urban management.

Economic Development Committee
Headed by a businessperson, this committee created closer relationships between the municipality and business community. It improved collection of taxes and also in having the business owners pave the business district.

Accountability and Consultation Program
Mazar-e-Sharif municipality officials introduced face-to-face gatherings for direct talks with the people. These have proven effective - a decision made by the first meeting of this program was to uphold the people’s objection to turn the medians to parking areas.

Consulting Gozar Organizations and Community Development Councils, (from Abdul Habib Bahar, Bazarak Municipality, Panjshir)
Bazarak municipality developed its first municipal development plan with series of consultation with community representatives through Gozar Organization and Community Development Council. This participatory process resulted in public acceptance of the new municipal development plan which will hopefully enjoy public support to the implementation as well.

Citizens’ Ownership, (from Roobika Noori, RAMP-UP North, Mazar-e-Sharif)
Candidateship in an advisory board created by the Municipality for a waste collection project was open to all, and particularly women, for a two-week period. In that period the member would enthusiastically promote public awareness in her region, and this resulted in a better neighborhood and a cleaner place to live.

Annual Accomplishment Report (from Amanullah Fagiree, UNDP-ASGP, Kabul)
Based on a guideline by UNDP-ASGP, 12 municipalities prepared, published and disseminated their annual accomplishment report. It was structured to have Profile of the city, essential information on municipality and next year’s development plan.

Creating Gozar Organizations (from Nasir Ahmad Salehzada, UNDP-ASGP, Kabul)
Gozar Organizations prepared Gozar profiles and development plans in a participatory approach with focus on community priorities. Some of results from this scheme were: Improved interaction between municipality and citizens, diverse levels of participation, a community-municipality initiative for waste collection, improved Gozar advocacy, local oversight over projects and programs, and most importantly domestic and local solutions to local problems.

University-Municipal Partnership (from Mohammad Naseer Hamidi, UNDP, Kabul)
ASGP worked in Mazar on partnership-building between the university and the municipality in 1) a University- Municipal Committee; with a student-led municipal administration in the University; 2) Internships for municipality jobs and 3) Research and Development. The internship program offered the municipality access to young professionals and allowed the university to equip students with practical skills and work experience.

Mazar-e-Sharif and Herat
Young Professionals’ Engagement in Municipal Governance, (from Ahmad Sayed Faizi, GDMA-IDLG, Kabul)

One example of citizen engagement was in public consultation in law drafting process in thirty three cities. Another was for students of the engineering faculty to take a practicum in municipal projects that involved assisting with oversight responsibilities for road construction.

Herat

From Alhaj Mohammad Salim Taraki, Herat Municipality, Herat

Scientific Advisory Board

Herat Municipality has an advisory board comprising of representatives from academia, different cultural and religious societies, private sector and governmental line departments engaged in urban services. The Advisory Board has both increased participation and brought discussion and consensus to common concerns and needs. A Municipal Governance and Development Board is also being created in the city comprising of all key stakeholders.

Radio and TV Programs

Radio and TV programs in Herat city are enhancing people’s interactions and participation with the Municipality. These programs have resulted in a direct connection of the people with the Municipality, including broad access to the Municipality’s information, feedback to the Municipality on its week points and strengths, and public awareness about municipal affairs.

Website for Public Access

Herat Municipality has developed a website for ease of access to the Municipality’s information from all over the world.

Organizing Festivals

Herat organizes festivals that are used to increase public awareness on municipal affairs, by encouraging filmmakers to feature the Municipality’s successes and challenges.

School, University and Economic Development Committee (also recommended by Ahmad Shahir Salehi, UNDP-ASGP, Herat)

Herat city has 10 municipal school committees, a municipal university committee and a committee on economic development of the city. These committees give students and people a good picture of the municipality and its responsibilities. School mayors have produced cleaner school environments and increased attention to development activities. They have also produced closer ties with parents and increased volunteerism for civic education.

Gozar and Nahia Councils

More than 200 Gozar and 12 Nahia councils have been created to bring more participation and representation in municipal governance. These councils make local profiles, alleviate disputes between people and implement small size projects.

Accountability and Consultation Meetings

With great participation of the people, Herat Municipality has gatherings on accountability, as well as budget hearings to collect people’s advice on priorities and necessities. These bring more accountability, greater public awareness on municipal affairs, popular participation in solving local problems, and better access of the Municipality to information.
Citizen Engagement in Project Design and Implementation  
(from Engr. Mohammad Yasin Hilal, Kabul Municipality, Kabul)

With the help of UN-HABITAT Kabul Municipality introduced citizen participation to improve planned and unplanned areas, creating elected male and female Community Development Councils to determine neighborhood needs. Communities provided financial and physical contributions to implement small projects like concreting the roads, streams, culverts and canals. People fully took part in project maintenance, and a spirit of cooperation was enhanced.

Citizen Initiative for Waste Collection  
(from Zabihullah Habib Afrooz, NEPA, Kabul)

A Kabul neighborhood started an initiative to collect the garbage from a dump area, and established a Green Institution to systematically handle this problem through public consensus. The initiative produced a cleaner neighborhood and also was replicated by other neighborhoods.

Change Through Role Modeling  
(from Mohammad Naseer Hamidi, UNDP, Kabul)

Municipal employees on their way to office began voluntarily knocking snow off the Municipality’s tree saplings to prevent their breaking under heavy snow. This motivated the local shopkeepers and other people to take on this responsibility, demonstrating how the role of the Municipality can be reduced and civic responsibility and interaction with the people increased.

Kunduz

University-Municipal Committee

A University-Municipal committee was created at Kunduz University through open and free elections. Among other benefits such as great youths’ engagement and leadership skills, platform for environmental advocacy, it also resulted in the conduct of English and computer classes for municipal staff by the university volunteer students. To make this structure more effective, it requires some good resources for its activities of public awareness and environmental protection.

Citizen Advisory Groups “Youths, Women and Private Sector”

Kunduz municipality created advisory groups to get itself closer to specific groups and to be well aware of needs and concerns of various segments for proper decision making and timely response. These groups were helpful in raising awareness for tax payment and contributions.

Kunduz and Maimana

Self-Help by the Business Community

Kunduz Municipality was supported by ASGP to work with business community to improve their business environment, encouraging a "cleaner and healthier business space". Business owners paved their sidewalks with public financial contributions, with the municipality providing technical support and water for concrete. Similarly, in Maimana, through a self-help promotion campaign, the community graveled a road and cleaned a canal.

Asa’ad Abad, Kunar

Monthly Accountability Meeting  
(from Mohammad Amin Tokhi, Kunar Governor’s Office, Asa’ad Abad-Kunar)
Asa’ad Abad introduced a monthly meeting with representatives from the business community, tribal elders, provincial councils, municipality staff and the Governor’s office. The meeting aims to promote trust and advocate for the transparency, honesty and hardworking efforts of the municipality.

Farah

City Greening (from Haji Mohammad Gul Seddique, UNAMA, Farah)
In 2010, UNAMA, together with the mayor’s office, established an Elders’ Committee for greening the city of Farah, one of the warmest cities in Afghanistan. They distributed saplings among shopkeepers to plant and protect them, with the municipality occasionally helping out with watering. As a result Farah has turned into a green city.

North and Northeast Municipalities of Afghanistan

Municipal Budget Hearing Session, (from Engr. Zabihullah Issa, Ramp Up North/USAID, Mazar-e-Sharif)
RAMP UP North supported budget hearings in the municipalities of north and northeast Afghanistan, presenting a list of municipal priority projects to stakeholders for discussion and feedback. The process resulted in the inclusion, for example, of projects advocated by women and other groups, and enhanced the sense of ownership and trust in municipal governance, transparency and accountability. Mid-term reviews were also carried out to assess progress.

Citizen Feedback, (from Enayatullah Mujaddidi, Swedish committee for Afghanistan, Mazar-e-Sharif)
In north and northeast Afghanistan, the Swedish Committee for Afghanistan worked with municipalities to introduce complaints boxes on their websites and facebook pages.

From Nidhi Batra, the World Bank and Society for Participatory Research in Asia (PRIA), New Delhi India. More experiences are at PRIA’s blog Terra Urban.

Jhunjhunu, Rajasthan, India

Community Waste Collection
PRIA helped create “Mohalla samitis” (Community Councils) to deal with problem of solid waste disposal, relying on financial contributions of residents. The Municipality adopted the initiative, and today there is door-to-door garbage collection in 12 of 35 wards. Former garbage dumps have been turned into parks, with the Municipality contributing 70 per cent of the cost and the neighborhoods raising 30 per cent to convert the plots into gardens.

Raipur, Ranchi, Varanasi, Patna, Varanasi and Shimla, India

Citizen Report Card (CRC) and Other Social Accountability Mechanisms
To improve public service delivery and accountability, PRIA introduced the “Citizen Report Card” and other reforms and instruments in selected cities under the Jawaharlal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission (JNNURM) that enhanced the ability of citizens, and particularly the poor and marginalized, to engage with public servants, representatives and agencies in a more informed direct and constructive manner.

Rajasthan, Chhattisgarh and Bihar States, India

Strengthening the Voice of the Urban Poor in India
PRIA introduced a 3-part tool for strengthening the voice of the poor in selected States: providing communities with information gathered on slum conditions government schemes and policies addressing them; organizing slum improvement committees mandated to take action; and encouraging dialogue between the committees and the governing bodies. The approach has been more effective than working through the formal local elected bodies.

Bangalore, India

**Community Service in the University System** *(from Hamidullah Afghan, IDLG, Kabul)*

Matriculation at St. Joseph’s College in Bangalore University required extra-curricular voluntary credit that could include social work and community service. The experience promoted volunteerism, civic responsibility and awareness of young professionals of the social problems facing the Community.

Orangi town, Karachi, Pakistan

**Students as Technical Resource Persons** *(from Mohammad Naseer Hamidi, UNDP, Kabul)*

Orangi town of Karachi engaged students in community improvement efforts through offering cheap engineering services to the poor community. School students were equipped with basic knowledge of surveying, designing, sketching and construction supervision to provide the poor with a home plan for only 500 Rupees. It allowed the poor to have a standard home plus a well-planned and esthetic neighborhood. The scheme was replicated in Mazar-e-Sharif.

Khuda Ki Basti, Karachi

**NGO as Settlement Manager** *(from Mohammad Naseer Hamidi, UNDP, Kabul)*

Khuda ki Basti (God’s Settlement) is a low-income housing project by the government and NGO that enabled the poor have a dwelling place. In KKB, low-income people have constructed their houses on a self-help basis. The NGO supports the settlement by linking it up with service providing NGOs and government departments. As such, the settlement has comparatively good social sector facilities.

---

**Related Resources**

**Recommended Documentation**

From *Nader Yama, IDLG, Kabul*

**Should China Revisit the 1994 Fiscal Reforms?**


Available at: [http://www2.lse.ac.uk/asiaResearchCentre/_files/ARCWP52-Ahmad.pdf](http://www2.lse.ac.uk/asiaResearchCentre/_files/ARCWP52-Ahmad.pdf) [PDF, Size: 790 KB]

*Suggests further decentralization and more domestic resource mobilization and developing local and municipal financing mechanisms.*

**Financing Social Policy in the Presence of Informality**

Available at: http://www2.lse.ac.uk/asiaResearchCentre/_files/ARCWP54-AhmadBest.pdf [PDF, Size: 903 KB]

Offers a general framework for analyzing the effects of various taxes and benefits on incentives for firms and workers to operate in the informal sector and evade taxation.

From Ahmad Zubair Fattahi, UNDP, Kabul

Participatory Budgeting: Concepts and Practices
Presentation on the Participatory Budgeting Pilot, for a World Bank Workshop on Participatory Budgeting, Tirana, Albania, 12 May 2004;

Explains what Participatory Budgeting (PB) is, why local governments promote PB, how to implement PB, PB best practices and lessons learnt.

A Guide to Participatory Budgeting
A Guidebook by Brian Wampler, the World Bank, October 2000.
Available at: http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTPCENG/214578-1116506912206/20508879/WamplerPB.pdf [PDF, Size: 108 KB]

Details the background of participatory budgeting, the Brazilian experience and conditions required for its application in countries beyond Brazil

Lessons from Latin American Experience in Participatory Budgeting
Paper presented by Benjamin Goldfrank, University of New Mexico, at the Latin American Studies Association Meeting, San Juan, Puerto Rico, March 2006. Available at: http://www.internationalbudget.org/themes/PB/LatinAmerica.pdf [PDF, Size: 237 KB]

Defines and introduces Participatory Budgeting, analyses its application in Latin America, highlighting results and lessons learnt from the experience.

Participatory Budgeting: A Significant Contribution to Participatory democracy

A systematic analysis of participatory budgeting in Brazil and the range of PB experience of 25 municipalities in Latin America and Europe

Participatory Budgeting in Porto Alegre, Toward a Redistributive Democracy

Analyzes one urban experiment in Porto Alegre aimed at redistributing city resources in favor of more vulnerable social groups by means of participatory democracy

Planning for High Density in Low-Income Settlements “Four Case Studies from Karachi” (from Mohammad Naseer Hamidi, UNDP, Kabul)

Illustrations of government, people and NGOs creating a settlement and living area, and how the settlements are reacting socially and economically.

From Nidhi Batra, the World Bank and Society for Participatory Research in Asia, New Delhi India

Terra Urban
A blog ("Urban Forum") by PRIA and the Society for the Promotion of Area Resource Centers (SPARC). http://terraurban.wordpress.com

Focuses on urban solutions in the Indian context, including examples of tools to strengthen the voice of the citizen.

74th Amendment of the Constitutional Act, 1992
Legislation of Government of India. Available at: http://indiacode.nic.in/coiweb/amend/amend74.htm

Guarantees existence of municipalities as institutions of urban local governance and defines citizen engagement and conduct of elections.

Citizen Engagement in Urban Governance: Lessons in Small and Medium Towns in India

Describes PRIA’s approaches and challenges faced for promoting citizen participation and civic engagement in urban governance.

Civic Infrastructure a New Approach to Improving Community Life (from Napoleon De Sagun, Individual Consultant, Philippines)

Discusses past and current facts of community empowerment and government, scrutinizing a civic index of ten crucial components of a community.

From Nematullah Haidari, Research Specialist

Citizen Engagement and Democratic Local Governance
Background Paper by Mark Robinson of the Institute of Development Studies prepared for the Resources, Citizen Engagement and Democratic Local Governance (ReCiTE) Project Planning Workshop, Trivandrum, Kerala, held 4-16 January 2004 by the Learning Initiative to Strengthen Citizen Participation and Local Governance (LogoLink). Available at: www.logolink.org/index.php/resource/download/512 [PDF, Size: 163 KB]

Discusses ways that citizens engage in local fiscal processes, the power dynamics that influence citizen engagement, and specific outcomes realised

Citizen Participation in Challenging Contexts
Analysis of citizen participation and social control in the Americas, Africa and Asia in the last 10 years, highlighting the challenges of democratization and decentralization

Building Democratic Governance: Tools and Structures for Engaging Citizens

Principles, suggestions and ideas for local elected leaders becoming involved in citizen engagement, and the political, financial, and bureaucratic challenges confronting them.

Localizing Development: Does Participation Work?

Focuses on “demand-side” aspects of participatory development by assessing the impact of large-scale, policy driven efforts to induce participation.

Guidelines on Citizens’ Engagement for Development Management and Public Governance

A concise and practical reference tool for national government policymakers to successfully plan and implement citizen engagement processes

Recommended Organizations and Programmes

Independent Directorate of Local Governance (IDLG) (from Ahmad Shahir Salehi, UNDP-ASGP, Herat; Hamidullah Afghan, Nader Yama)
Ariana Square, Kabul, Afghanistan, Phone: +93 (0) 752105014. Website: http://www.idlg.gov.af

The national Government agency responsible for local governance in Afghanistan, superintending governors, mayors, Provincial Councils and district governors.

Afghanistan Subnational Governance Program (ASGP) (from Ahmad Sayed Faizi, GDMA-IDLG, Kabul; Ahmad Shahir Salehi, UNDP-ASGP, Herat; Nasir Ahmad Salehzada, Amanullah Faqree, Abdul Satar Seerat, UNDP-ASGP, Kabul; Saved Hafeezullah Rohany, UNDP-ASGP; Mazar-e-Sharif Mohammad Naseer Hamidi, UNDP, Kabul)
UNOCA Compound, Jalalabad Road, Pule-Charkhi, Kabul, Afghanistan, Mob: +93 (0) 799 127 827

A UNDP-sponsored multi-donor programme implemented by IDLG to strengthen sub-national government institutions through advocacy, policy advice and capacity-building

Regional Afghan Municipalities Program for Urban Populations (RAMP-UP) (From Engr. Zabihullah Issa, Ramp Up North/USAID, Mazar-e-Sharif, David Stonehill USAID, Kabul)

USAID’s RAMP UP project, in collaboration with IDLG, helps urban governments create effective, responsive, democratic, transparent and accountable governance

Mazar-e-Sharif Municipality, (From Nasir Ahmad Salehzada, UNDP-ASGP, Kabul; Saved Hafeezullah Rohany, UNDP-ASGP; Mazar-e-Sharif Ahmad Sayed Faizi, GDMA-IDLG, Kabul; Mohammad Naseer Hamidi, UNDP, Kabul)
Mazar-e-Sharif, Balkh, Phone: +93 (0)700508171 Email: Yonos.mogim@mazar-m.gov.af or info@mazar-m.gov.af. Website: www.mazar-m.gov.af

Municipality having several innovative examples of citizen engagement - Nahia council, Gozar organization, University-Municipal Committees, Citizen Advisory Groups, etc.

Herat Municipality (From Alhaj Mohammad Salim Taraki, Herat Municipality, Herat, Ahmad Shahir Salehi, UNDP-ASGP, Herat, Ahmad Sayed Faizi, GDMA-IDLG, Kabul)
Herat, Phone: +93 (0) 799464106, Email: Spokesperson@herat-m.gov.af or Info@herat-m.gov.af Website: www.herat-m.gov.af

Municipality having several innovative examples of citizen engagement - Scientific advisory board, School-Municipal Committees, Website, Newsletter, Film Festivals etc.

National Civil League (from Napoleon De Sagun, Individual Consultant, Philippines)
1889 York Street, Denver, CO 80206, Phone: 303-571-4343. Website: http://www.ncl.org

Offers community service programs to address current US challenges including green and sustainable solutions, racial inequity, and immigrant integration strategies.

St. Joseph’s College, Bangalore India (from Hamidullah Afghan, IDLG, Kabul)
Lalbagh Road Bangalore, Karnataka,560-027. Website: http://www.sjc.ac.in/

An affiliated college of Bangalore University, which introduced a cell for students to get credit for social work and community service.

From Nidhi Batra, the World Bank and Society for Participatory Research in Asia, New Delhi, India

Society of Participatory Research in Asia (PRIA)
Head office, Tughlakabad Institutional Area, New Delhi – 110062, Phone:+91-011-29960931/32/33, Fax: +91-11-29955183, Email: info@pria.org Website: http://www.pria.org

Indian NGO and international center for learning, policy advocacy and promotion of citizen-centric development, participation and democratic governance.

International Association for Public Participation
13762 Colorado Blvd. Suite 124 PMB 54, Thornton, CO 80602 USA, Phone: + 61 881200669, Email: iap2hq@iap2.org, Website: http://www.iap2.org

Seek to promote and improve the practice of public participation in relation to individuals, governments, institutions, and other entities that affect the public interest in nations throughout the world

Jawaharlal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission (JNNURM)
India, Telephone: 009123062309, Email: nisha.singh@nic.in, jsnurm_mud@nic.in. Website: http://jnnurm.nic.in

The largest initiative of the Government of India, under the Ministry of Urban Development, for a planned development of India’s cities.

Rajiv Awas Yojana (RAY)
A project of the JNNRUM. Read more at: http://mhupa.gov.in/ray/02-RAY-Guidelines.pdf [PDF, Size: 224 KB]

A scheme under the Ministry of Housing and Urban Poverty Alleviation to alleviate poverty and reduce slum areas in India.
Responses in Full

Nasir Ahmad Salehzada, UNDP-ASGP, Kabul

Through UNDP-ASGP, we worked with municipalities in different regions in Afghanistan to create Gozar Organizations as community based governance structures through free and open elections at the Gozar level. We not only supported the creation but also their capacity building to prepare Gozar profiles and development plans in a participatory approach with focus on community priorities.

Some of its good results include:

- Improved interaction between municipality and citizens,
- Presence of qualified people including women and youths on the Gozar board to manage Gozar Affairs in coordination with the municipality and other partners,
- Emergence of joint community-municipality initiative for waste collection that is role model of citizen engagement in service delivery,
- Improved Gozar advocacy to channel municipal support to the respective Gozar and
- Oversight over projects and programs in the Gozar.

An example from Mazar-e-Sharif shows that the GO at their cost, operates and manages a Zaranj motorbike provided by the municipality from ASGP resources to collect and dispose waste. This component sharing model is a good example of local solution to a local problem, closely working their municipality.

For more effectiveness of these structures, I suggest GDMA formulates a policy to replace the Kalantar system with these elected heads of Gozar Organizations to streamline it.

Roobika Noori, RAMP-UP North, Mazar-e-Sharif

This response moves the dialogue to creating citizen ownership for effective engagement in municipal governance.

Ahmad Shahir Salehi, UNDP-ASGP, Herat
Initially, I express my appreciation for this modern initiative. It is a valuable platform for us to reach a wider group of practitioners in the field of municipalities.

I am happy to exemplify an experience of engaging youths in governance. We did this through establishing school-based governance structures called “School-Municipal Committee”. Each committee is elected and consists of mayor, deputy mayor, treasurer and outreach officer elected by school students. It is voluntary and instilling practices for mayoral elections at schools. Further, it has helped for civic education and advocacy for environmental protection.

In Herat, we have ten of them now and if I give example of a school, the school-municipal committee holds special office, with sub-committee for specific functions. The successes of this experience are:

a. School youths have been equipped with leadership skills and knowledge of municipal governance and services and setting up a pole of young leaders for the future of municipalities
b. Cleaner and greener school environment with students’ contributions” labor and financial support” and in coordination with the municipality
c. Closer school ties with the students’ parents
d. Increased volunteerism for civic education and contribution to improving living environment

IDLG and Ministry of Education can work together to institutionalize this structure countrywide for every school and treat this as the only structure. This way, any organization working with students for environment, hygiene, peace can be instructed to use this instead of creating new structures.

Engr. Mohammad Yasin Hilal, Kabul Municipality, Kabul

Here is a good experience in Kabul City with UN-Habitat involving Community Development Committees (CDCs) for community development in a component sharing approach.

یو ښه تجربه د کابل (په زیرالویو ولAlright به همدیشته د حکومتوالی په برخه کی د سوونیکو نیرو ور شوی؟ دا تجربه د سیمه په بیرمینه نیرو اخیسته بیا دهند. دا سیمه په بیرمینه نیرو اخیسته بیا دهند. دا سیمه په بیرمینه نیرو اخیسته بیا دهند. دا سیمه په بیرمینه نیرو اخیسته بیا دهند.

""""

در شاروالو کابل، ما در همکاری با همگانه، نجیب خون در نواحی مختلف در قسمت طرح و تطبیق برخه های مختلف از همکاری با همکاری می‌گردد. شرکت‌های مختلف و مهارتی موسسه‌های ملکه اقدام به پیشنهای کردند. برخه های پیشنهای شان شامل کارکرد ریزی سربه‌ها، جوییها، لیگها و کانالها بوده است. مستقیمیت های این برخه از همکاری با همکاری می‌گردد.

در اینجا خیلی مهم است: 1 مردم از 15% تا 54% سهم مالی داشته اند (2) برخلاف برخه هاییکه ما خود
One workable experience we had through RAMP UP NORTH is Municipal Budget Hearing Session in North and Northeast Municipalities in Afghanistan. It was used as a tool to present list of municipal priority projects to citizens/stakeholders (municipal districts, civil society, NGOs, Government line departments, academic institutions, and professional bodies...) for their information, discussion and feedback to better shape the development framework for the upcoming fiscal year. The end result of such session has been a list of development projects publicly approved or approved by the stakeholders.

With the aforesaid, we were able to increase stakeholders’ engagement in decision making that resulted in the inclusion of some projects advocated by women and specific communities. This, among others, is helpful to enhance ownership and trust in municipal government, improve transparency and accountability by engaging them and also ensure fair distribution of resources for different parts of the city.

The method we applied is plus mid-year reviews to assess the implementation and come up with remedial plans if necessary.

In India, to engage the citizens, make the urban local bodies more efficient at the grassroots, responding to the local needs and requirements, decentralization and devolution of functions and powers has been proposed under the 74th Amendment of the Constitutional Act, 1992. There are many mandates of this amendment that aim for a bottom-up development methodology in contrast to the top-down system.

In such a context, it has been realized that citizen engagement in the process of urban governance, is a need of the hour that shall provide the necessary voice to the urban citizens, make municipal organizations accountable and as well as inculcate a sense of responsibility in the citizens towards urban affairs and issues.

Citizen engagement goes beyond conventional public consultation by enabling citizens to do more than simply voice an opinion- it also allows participation in the decision-making deliberation process.

Citizen engagement results in
a. **Improved project conceptualization and decision making** including identification of services, definition of service levels, identification of preference for channels of service access, and appropriate process re-engineering
b. **Increased Awareness** leading to increased uptake of services, avoidance of conflict, increased sustainability, increased transparency and accountability
a. **Community Empowerment** leading to better monitoring Capacity Building

In addition, public participation also enhances citizen’s recognition of their responsibility to take action to improve their lives and the provision of basic social services, citizen ownership of development processes, and implementation of development programs

The key to citizen engagement is the “**engage-collaborate-empower**” continuum set forth in the public involvement spectrum developed by the International Association for Public Participation.

A variety of mechanisms have been employed by **Society of Participatory Research in Asia (PRIA)** an NGO in India, to promote citizen participation and civic engagement in urban governance such as information sharing, consultation, joint assessment, and shared decision-making and collaboration. PRIA and its partners initiated a number of interventions for facilitating citizen engagements such as:

- Pre-election voters’ awareness campaigns
- Campaigns on birth registration
- Campaigns on access to sanitation services
- Organization building (Mohalla Samities) / Slum Improvement Committees
- Social accountability mechanisms
- Participatory planning and slum upgrading

Read more at [http://www.pria.org/docs/resources_pdf/Occassional_Paper_9_March%20.pdf](http://www.pria.org/docs/resources_pdf/Occassional_Paper_9_March%20.pdf) [PDF, Size: 164 KB]. Some of the highlighted examples of Organisation building and the tool to strengthen the voice of citizen can also be traced in an urban forum initiated by PRIA called Terra Urban: [http://terraurban.wordpress.com/](http://terraurban.wordpress.com/)

Some examples of citizen engagement as initiated by PRIA are highlighted below:

**Example 1: Community-led garbage collection in Jhunjhunu**

Organizations like PRIA (Participatory Research in Asia) and other local groups began working on urban issues and set up mohalla samitis in Jhunjhunu, essentially to deal with the problem of solid waste disposal. The mohalla samitis took up the task of garbage collection. Residents were expected to contribute money so that there could be door-to-door collection of garbage. In the middle class colonies, in particular, there was a good response and residents were pleased at the cleaner look of their colonies. In some areas, residents raised their own funds to clean up open plots that had been turned into garbage dumps. They converted these into gardens that serve the need for open space for the locality.

*The municipality built on this initiative and today there is door-to-door collection of garbage in 12 of the 35 wards. The municipality has also responded to the initiative of residents who have created parks from garbage dumps. It now has a scheme where it contributes 70 per cent of the cost and expects the neighborhood to raise the remaining 30 per cent to convert such empty plots into gardens.*

**Example 2: Supporting ULBs (Urban Local Bodies) in Institutionalizing Social Accountability Mechanisms**
PRIA had carried out a preliminary Citizen Report Card (CRC) initiative in selected wards in the six cities of Raipur, Ranchi, Varanasi, Patna, Varanasi and Shimla. Another important activity that was initiated in all these cities was to strengthen the citizen-government interface through supporting progressive reforms and instruments under the Jawaharlal Nehru National Urban Renewal Mission (JNNURM). PRIA explored the ways and means of enhancing the ability of citizens (especially the poor and the marginalized) to engage with public servants, representatives and agencies in a more informed, direct and constructive manner so as to improve public service delivery and their accountability towards citizens in Raipur, Ranchi and Varanasi. Under this project, a more extensive involvement of the ULBs was attempted as they adopted some new mechanisms (and improved some existing ones) to enhance their accountability towards citizens.

**Example 3: Strengthening Voice of Urban Poor in India under larger gambit of urban poverty schemes**

A three pronged tool for strengthening the voice of those impoverished in the urban milieu has been initiated, with an overall aim and goal that community themselves are the real stakeholders and can bring about the requisite change and development.

In Rajasthan, Chhattisgarh and Bihar – PRIA with its partners began by preparing an information base of existing slums, the situations therein, relevant government schemes and policies addressing urban poverty and also gathered information on participation levels of community in these slums. This was the first step towards a scenario building. This has been followed by a community empowerment exercise of providing the information gathered through this process back to the community.

The second step is to give the power of ‘knowledge’ to the community. Slum improvement committees or community leaders are being organised in various slum communities. These committees are empowered with relevant knowledge about the most pressing issue for that particular slum, and methods of how the community themselves can initiate a movement to resolve those issues. This committee acts as an interface for the community and governing bodies.

The third step is to encourage dialogues between various slum committees and the elected representatives and all other stakeholders. These dialogues are one of a kind, since in most urban local bodies – there isn’t a mechanism where the poor can come together and discuss their issues out in the open with the decision makers. Lots of poverty alleviation schemes such as RAY (Rajiv Awas Yojana, a scheme in India) speak of community participation, but all failed to formulate a tangible system for the same. Unfortunately the whole mechanism of decentralisation and mechanism of ward committees and area sabhas are also not active.

Follow the blog [http://terraurban.wordpress.com/](http://terraurban.wordpress.com/) for more everyday challenges of community engagement in municipal governance, delivery and accountability issues towards urban poverty.

---

**Ahmad Zubair Fattahi, United Nations Development Program (UNDP), Kabul**

In response to your question, I would like to introduce the concept of Participatory Budgeting (PB) which has now been recognized globally as a Best Practice for promoting citizen’s
participation in decision making. In addition to increasing public participation, numerous empirical studies show that PB is an effective tool for reducing poverty and practicing good governance. PB is a system which allows citizens to make decision on allocations of budget and selection of municipal projects and activities. Community members take active role in selection of projects and funding mechanisms.

For the first time, PB was practiced in the city of Porto Alegre, Brazil, in 1989. Currently well over 1000 municipalities around the world, mainly in Latin America but also in Asia, Europe and Africa, practice PB.

While there are guidelines for implementation of PB, Afghan municipalities can tailor PB policies as per the local context and needs. For more information on PB, I share the following links:


- “Participatory budgeting: a significant contribution to participatory democracy”, Journal of “Environment and Urbanization 2004, 16/27”, The online version of this article can be found at: http://eau.sagepub.com/content/16/1/27.full.pdf [PDF, Size: 640 KB]

- And, “Participatory budgeting in Porto Alegre, Toward a Redistributive Democracy”, by “Boaventura De Sousa Santos”; you can find the article through Sage Publications at http://pas.sagepub.com/content/26/4/461.full.pdf

Khesraw Qaderi, National Democratic Institute (NDI), Mazar-e-Sharif
Result of a public awareness effort in Mazar-e-Sharif.

Enayatullah Mujaddidi, Swedish committee for Afghanistan, Mazar-e-Sharif
An ASGP’s experience with complaint boxes/websites and Facebook pages.
در وظیفه قبلی ام با شاروالیها از طریق برنامه حاکمیت محلی افغانستان، راهکار هایی را در این زمینه تطبیق کردم که عبارتند از: نشست های مشورتی و نظارت شهروندی. در بخش مشوره، تمرکز روی برنامه های انکشافی بوده است که در شاروالی های شمال و شمال شرق صورت گرفته اما برای نظارت شهروندی، و ارائه یافته ها از طریق انتقادات، شکایات و پیشنهادات، صندوق های شکایات را در شهرستان و جهگان و برخی شاروالی های دیگر نصب کرده ام. همچنین، در وب سایت ابکه برای شاروالی ها ساخته شده است، شکایت الکترونی را مطرح کرده و انتقادات، نظریات و پیشنهادات مردم مستقیماً به آدرس شاروالان بررسید. صفحات فیسبوک را ساخته تا شرکتی را مورد با شاروالی روی موضوعات مختلف مداوماً بحث کند.

Mohammad Amin Tokhi, Konar Governor's Office, Asa’ad Abad-Kunar
Asadabad’s “monthly accountability sessions”.

میان‌شماری حساب و کوکوکی ناستی.

در شهر اسعد اباد، ما نشست ماهوار حسابدهی شاروالی به اشتراک نمایندگان اصناف، بزرگان قومی، نمایندگان شورای ولایت، کارمندان شاروالی و نماینده ولایت داریم. از طریق بیان، شاروالی گزارش وجود نشته و لاش و جوکویی مصرف ار این جزئیات ارائه می‌دارد تا به شفافیت، صادقیت و شفقت بیشتری از طرف مردم نسبت به شاروالی های این منطقه را در دریچه نمایندگان پیاده و از طریق برنامه‌های موجود در شهرستان و شاروالی های دیگر اجرا کنند. در صورتی که تحقیق و تلاش در این زمینه انجام شود، مردم باید بهتر بازخوانی به نزدیکی و حساسیت منابع وزارت مربوطه برای پروژه‌های آنها بینش دهند. دلیل این موضوع، وجود منابع وزارت مربوطه برای پروژه‌های شاروالی هنوز ظرفیت مالی برای تعویض این ساختارها را ندارند. خلاصه، این مشورت به باشند نشته دارد و از طرف مردم باید به شماری کمک و پیکاری یابد.

Abdul Habib Bahar, Bazarak Municipality, Panjsheer
Consulting Organizations and Community Development Councils (CDC) for Bazarak’s Municipal Development Plan.

د کوچی او کلی د شرالی سره مشوره د شاروالی د برخخی دیلیان به هکل ها.

من شخصاً مشورت با مردم را یک راهکار خوب برای سهیم سازی شهروندان میدانم. این مشورت، منوانت برای ساختن یک سازمان جامعیتی در شهر مشترک که به افراد و سازمان‌ها به کمکی به دست آوردن و به شفافیتی در کارهای شرکتی کمک کند. در سال جاری برای شاروالی بازیکن این انتخابات واقعی توجه می‌کنیم و برای امکان‌پذیری این کمک‌ها در نحوه فعالیت‌های کمک‌رسانی و تربیت‌سازی شوراهای ۱۵ دیگر و کمک‌رسانی در ساختارهای انتخاباتی قربانی را به خاطر داشته‌اند. در واقع، این مشورت به کمکی به دیگر میزان صنایعی می‌رساند و می‌تواند در ساختارهای انتخاباتی شاروالی را به توانایی کردن.

پیشنهاد دارم که فعالیت و حضور قربانیها در نظام شهری تصفیه گردد و شورا های گذشته با قوطنی خود را مورد توجه قرار دهند.

Sayed Hafeezullah Rohany, UNDP-ASGP (Afghanistan Sub-National Governance Program), Mazar-e-Sharif
5 good examples of citizen engagement from Mazar-e-Sharif, explaining the Nahia Council, citizen advisory groups, the “City Technical Management and Oversight committee”, the “Economic Development Committee” and accountability and consultation forums.

پیشنهاد می‌کنم به دیگر شهرهای افغانستان همگام به این اخ‌نامه‌هایی به مراکزیفیتی در این مورد، شوراها، شورای‌های منطقه‌ای، مجلس شوراها و مجلس شورای کمیته‌های محیط‌زیستی، اقتصادی و خاصیت‌های مشترک، و صنایعی و حساب ورکنی مجلس شورای ملی.
راه اندازی چنین یک ابتکار به سبب‌های از مطالعات در تاریخ حکومتداری و انکشاف شهری را شایان تقدیر دانسته و موافقین این مجمع را در امر تحقق امید در برهنگی و مهارت‌های مسئولی ام.

خروسدن که یک مسأله مهم در فرهنگ حرفه‌ای همانا سهم‌گیری شهرداران در حل مشکلات شهری، توجه نمودن از این‌رو جامعه افغانستان برای حکومت افغانستان در کل برای خویش شهرزاده‌سازی که می‌توان آن‌ها از طریق سهیم سازی مردم در تصمیم‌گیری‌های به‌طور رسمی یا غیر رسمی با همکاری شناخته شود

چند مثال از تجربه‌های تأمین مردم در زمینه سهیم سازی شوراهای مردمی UNDP-ASGP

1. شورای ناحیه

در جنوبی شهر مرکزی، به تعمیق شوراهای گذر اختصاصی ساخته که هم‌اکنون گذر هم‌اکنون از همه‌گیر

2. گروه‌های مشورتی (زنان، جامعه مدنی، استادان دانشگاه)

برای حکومت‌های مرکزی و استانی به‌طور کامل، نیازمندی در بررسی‌های مختلف، شوراهای گذر کمک

3. کمیته‌های مدیریت و نظارت از شهر

بخاره و هماهنگ کردن، به کمک‌های تحقیقاتی مدیریت و نظارت از شهر، کمیته‌های تأمین مردمی و سایر ادارات دولتی و

4. کمیته انکشاف اقتصادی شهر

این کمیته را برای روابط نزدیکی شوراهای مرکزی بسیار خصوصی ساخته که حتی در راس آن یک

5. برنامه حسابداری و مشورتی

بچین برپا می‌شود و لازم است برگزار کرده‌اند. این انحراف بی‌ربطی با مصرف‌های مختلف و مصرف‌های ناسالم و یا شرکت در تشریحات است. نظر به مسئولیت‌های بحرانی که محاسبات برای کمک‌های پژوهش و

Amanullah Faqiree, UNDP-ASGP (Afghanistan Sub-National Governance Program), Kabul
In today’s world, communication is considered as a pre-requisite for wider participation which can occur at three levels: information sharing, consultation and decision making. Active participation in consultation, decision making, implementation, monitoring and evaluation is subject to timely, authentic and accurate information, so this gives communication a special place in ensuring meaningful participation.

Given the aforesaid fact, through UNDP-ASGP, we worked with municipalities to prepare and implement public communication and participation strategies to improve communication to people. Here I touch upon some examples of communication activities:

1. **Annual Accomplishment Reporting**

Based on a guideline developed by UNDP-ASGP, we supported over 12 municipalities to prepare, publish and disseminate annual accomplishment reports. For comprehensiveness and to satisfy public needs, the report was structured as: Profile of the city with essential information on the municipal structure and staffing; revenues and expenditures; ongoing and complement projects “municipality-funded and others (donors, line departments)”; municipal governance and development plan for next year.

2. **Governance Management Plans**

We helped municipalities to prepare governance management plans to meet stakeholders on regular basis to discuss municipal issues and programs and seek their support. This was well implemented.

3. **Radio and TV programs**

Under this, we organized radio and TV programs of mayors and others on specific municipal issues. These included round tables, live radio talks and interviews.

4. **Regular quarterly and annual accountability sessions**

This is going very well and municipalities have adopted this and regularly organize them with stakeholders to let them know about the progress in each period. It is also an opportunity for them to consult on certain aspects.

**Haji Mohammad Gul Seddique, UNAMA, Farah**

A great example of citizen engagement in Farah, illustrating how the Elders’ Committee for City Greening undertook the critical effort of raising awareness on the need for greening.

من مدت سه سال است که از طریق یونما در فراه ایفای وظیفه می نمایم. در این دوره یک تجربه مشترک با شارووالی در زمینه سهم سازی شهروندان در فراه دارم.
ممکن بدانید که هوای فراه نهایت گرم است. زمانی که من اینجا در سال 2212 آمدم، برعلاوه گرمی، خشک هم بود. بنابراین، در مشوره با شاروال و تیم کاری اش، کمیته بزرگان شهر را برای سرسبزی شهر ایجاد کردیم.

ازینطریق، نیاز به سرسبزی شهر را داغ ساختیم. در قد م اول، شاروالی در مسیر سرکها نهال شانی کرد و نهال های زیادی را توزیع را با گذار که دکانداران نهال را برای آنها پرداخت کردند. شاروالی، ساختم کمیته بخاطر اینکه نیاز شهر به نهال در داخل شهر مرفوع گردد، شاروالی یک گلخانه را در داخل شهر ساخت. نقش مردم در ابتدا حفاظت از نهال ها بود تا کسی تخریب نکند که آهسته آهسته تبدیل شد. امروز در نتیجه همین تلاش، فراه سرسبزی زیادی رقم می‌آورد و این انگیزه به سرعت در سرسبزی بیشتر فراه نقش بازی می‌نماید.

چالش‌های این کار دو چیز بود:
1) گرمی زیاد هوا
2) آگاهی پایین مردم. مگر شاروالی و کمیته توانستند با راه اندازی برنامه‌های آگاهی‌گذاری، رادیو و تلویزیون مردم را به حمایت از پروسه سرسبزی بکشانند. همچنان، چون هر نوع نهال در فراه نتیجه نمی‌داد. بدیل مناسب را یافتند که نهال روسی است و مردم پیش روی خانه‌هایشان غرس می‌کنند.

Ahmad Sayed Faizi, GDMA-IDLG, Kabul

نتیجه سه‌میل سازی گزارش‌سازان جوان در فراه نشان داد که سپاهان‌ها و فراز کار عملی برای مصالح

یوشتو، که توسط خانواده‌های شاروالی به‌همراه مصالحی در یوشتوها می‌باشد.

اکیان که راه اندازی برنامه‌های آگاهی‌گذاری ممکن است. به‌طوری‌که، و تولیدگران مراکز، این مقاله از تبلیغات و تولید به روش سرسپزی

بکشانند. همچنان، جوین مردم را به حمایت از پروسه سرسبزی که به‌همراه این نهال روشی است و

این انگیزه به سرعت در سرسبزی جوان در ممارسه کارشناسان زیادی و حتی غرس نهال ها نیز تبدیل شد. امروز در نتیجه همین تلاش، فراه سرسبزی زیادی رقم می‌آورد و

این انگیزه به سرعت در سرسبزی جوان در ممارسه کارشناسان زیادی و حتی غرس نهال ها نیز تبدیل شد. امروز در نتیجه همین تلاش، فراه سرسبزی زیادی رقم می‌آورد و

I am sharing two good examples of young professionals’ engagement in municipal governance. 1) Public Consultation in the Law Drafting Process: we held consultation workshops on the draft municipal law in 33 provincial capitals across the country. In each, we ensured youths’ participation which resulted in provision of great comments and suggestions for improvement. 2) University-Municipal Committee in Mazar-e-Sharif and Herat under ASGP, with which not only student-led municipal administrations are in place at universities but also ways have been opened for universities to go for practicum in municipal projects. Like in Mazar-e-Sharif, students of Engineering Faculty participated in a project to review the roads of the city.

Abdul Satar Seerat, UNDP-ASGP, Kabul

مثال‌های زیادی این کار دو چیز بود:
1) گرمی زیاد هوا
2) آگاهی پایین مردم. مگر شاروالی و کمیته توانستند با راه اندازی برنامه‌های آگاهی‌گذاری، رادیو و تلویزیون مردم را به حمایت از پروسه سرسبزی بکشانند. همچنان، جوین مردم را به حمایت از پروسه سرسبزی که به‌همراه این نهال روشی است و

I am happy to share three examples of public engagement and its results as follows:

1. **Self-Help Promotion**

Under ASGP, we worked with the business community in Kunduz and encouraged them to engage in the improvement of their business environment for their own good "cleaner and healthier business space". With this mobilization and awareness initiative, we were able to instill self-help and get the frontage of shops concreted with public financial contributions. But to encourage this, the municipality also partnered with the technical design and monitoring and supply of water for the concrete work. As a broader result, it laid down the foundation for volunteerism in development. Another example is from Maimana where we witnessed road gravelling and canal cleaning by the communities as a result of the self-help promotion campaign. To be noted that this concept requires a lot of efforts.

2. **University-Municipal Committee**
Similar to Student-led municipalities in schools, we created University-Municipal Committee at Kunduz University through open and free elections. Among other benefits such as great youths’ engagement and leadership skills, platform for environmental advocacy, it also resulted in the conduct of English and computer classes for municipal staff by the university volunteer students. To make this structure more effective, it requires some good resources for its activities of public awareness and environmental protection.

3. Citizen Advisory Groups “Youths, Women and Private Sector”

To bring Kunduz municipality closer to specific groups and to be well aware of needs and concerns of various segments for proper decision-making and timely response, we helped the municipality to create advisory groups regularly meeting and discussing issues. These groups were helpful in raising awareness for tax payment and contributions.

Mohammad Naseer Hamidi, UNDP, Kabul

Pleasure is also mine to share with you some examples of citizen engagement in municipal governance as follows:

1. Community-based young technical resource persons

During my visit to Orangi town in Karachi in 2011, I went to a Technical Training Resource Center (TTRC) that is a great example of youths’ engagement in community improvement, offering cheap engineering services to the poor community. This center has equipped school students with basic knowledge and skills of survey, designing/sketching and improvement planning, technical supervision and on site guidance and is run by these youths. The idea behind going with school students is to keep low-cost of services and little monetary expectations. They believe that engineers with university background have high demands and the poor can’t afford their services. They prepare a survey map and improvement plan using AUTOCAD at the cost of 500 Rupees to the poor and guide them on the implementation. With this, they have been able to increase accessibility of low-cost engineering services and have resolved many community issues in terms of orientation, ventilation. Having been inspired by this, we trained some youths in Nahia 10 of Mazar-e-Sharif to replicate this experience.

2. Khuda Ki Basti in Karachi

Among others, it is a great example of public participation and NGO partnership. Members can look for Khuda Ki Basti on the web and learn more about this best practice.
http://pubs.iied.org/pdfs/10582IIED.pdf [PDF, Size: 283 KB]
http://www.urbandensity.org/khuda-ki-basti

3. Role Modeling as Agents of Change

Role modeling is a good educational tool to introduce a better treatment in order to replace an ineffective behavior. People will see and learn. Last year during the heavy snow in Kabul, we were on our way to office. We noticed there was a lot of snow on the newly planted saplings and there was a high risk of their break. So, we came out of the car and started to remove the snow from the saplings. Looking at us, the shopkeepers around and other passers started to do the same role modeled by us. Thus, I recommend, we role model for changes we want. Same is true
about municipal officials. Their behaviors towards environment should be a learning model for other citizens.

Hamidullah Afghan, IDLG, Kabul

It is immense pleasure to read many examples about citizen engagement in municipal governance. I want to add to the examples of University and School structures given by other members. During my studies at St. Joseph’s College in Bangalore University, there was a dedicated and institutionalized cell for Social Works in the university system. As per the requirement of university, each bachelor student had to complete 130 credits. Out of these, 120 credits had to be obtained from compulsory subjects and 10 credits through extra-curricular activities which included sports, social works and community service, active participation in various associations in the university, and honors courses. Student’s graduation was subject to 10 extra credits. So, many students carried out social services (Voluntary in nature) of various kinds in both urban and rural areas.

The Social Work Cell not only led to successful graduation, but also promoted volunteerism, civic responsibilities and awareness of young professional of the social or community problems and ground realities. This was helpful because it encompassed, for instance, planning and conduct of city cleaning campaigns and awareness raising initiatives.

With such a system in our schools and universities, we can help engage youths for voluntary services in cities. Such a practice will enable us harness the energy of the young generation with very less resources. I suggest IDLG’s work with Ministry of Higher Education and Ministry of Education to implement this model.

Zabihullah Habib Afroz, NEPA, Kabul

An experience on citizen participation in environmental affairs and what encourages people to participate actively.

A few suggestions on how we can engage citizens to protect the environment:

1. Implementing awareness campaigns about the importance of environmental protection.
2. Encouraging community-led initiatives for waste management and recycling.
4. Establishing formal mechanisms for citizen participation in environmental decision-making processes.
5. Providing platforms for citizen feedback and complaint redressal.

In conclusion, citizen engagement is crucial for effective environmental governance. By involving citizens in decision-making processes and providing them with the necessary tools and resources, we can foster a sustainable future for generations to come.
را درک کردند و این اقدام را یک کار بنیادی یافتند و امروز به تنهٔ ادامه آن حمایت می‌کنند بلکه شاهد توسعه آن در سایر محلات نیز هستند.

David Stonehill, USAID, Kabul
مثال های سههم سازی شهرهای معرفی شده از طریق RAMP UP و نیز این تکنیک که بورد‌های مشورتی، شاروالی‌های تاریخی برای شوراهای شاروالی می‌باشند. در نیروی اخیستنی بیلگی چی د RAMP UP لخوا ورپندل شویی ده، او همدا رنگه د باراپان، مشورتی بورد د سازواری شوراگاوه ته د وروستی قانونی تپار.

Thank you for kicking off this important dialogue with such a good question.

Over the past two years, the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID), through its Regional Afghan Municipalities Program for Urban Populations (RAMP-UP), has helped create a variety of forums that empower citizens to play a greater role in shaping municipal decision-making. Some examples include:

- Town Hall meetings open to the public
- Economic Development Committees representing the desires and concerns of the business community
- Youth forums
- Budget Hearings
- Radio and TV call-in shows connecting citizens with their Mayors
- Mock Municipality competitions in high-schools
- Municipal Advisory Boards that advocate on behalf of citizens

While all of these mechanisms are important and should continue in future years, it is essential that every municipality has an officially recognized body for handling citizen complaints, monitoring municipal projects, reviewing municipal budgets and fee structures, and holding municipal administrations accountable to the citizens. We appreciate GDMA’s efforts to institute Municipal Advisory Boards throughout Afghanistan in a manner that is transparent and representative of all citizens including women, business owners, and elders. Hopefully, Municipal Advisory Boards can serve as the foundation for Municipal Councils to be elected in the not-too-distant future.

Napoleon De Sagun, Individual Consultant, Philippines
نشریه‌ای پیرامون سه‌هم شهره‌ی آگهی نیای ارزیابی جامعه؛ این نشریه‌ی را در جریان مدیریت یک پروژه حکومتی در فلیپین ممکن بوده است. یوی خیرونه دیش‌رهانو ونه اخیستنی د تولیتی برختنی به اره؛ دغه خیرونه د بارای حکومتوالی پروژه د سبانیی‌نه لهٔ کی کیور دی.

I would like to recommend a publication on civic engagement for community development, which inspired me in managing the implementation of the USAID-funded Philippines Governance and Local Democracy (GOLD) Project in mid 90's. It is a short paper by John Parr, published in March 1993 and reprinted in June 2008 by the American journal, the National Civic Review (http://www.ncl.org/index.php?option=com_content&view=category&id=58&Itemid=209), discussing the past and current facts of community empowerment and government, organizing community dynamics into ten specific components that can be comparable across communities. An abstract is available at http://www.accessmylibrary.com/article-1G1-183043442/civic-infrastructure-new-approach.html.
Mohammad Naseer Hamidi, UNDP, Kabul

Example of internships in municipal affairs, and the focus of internships in municipal affairs in Mazar-e-Sharif.

Further to Mr. Hamidullah Afghan’s posting on engaging university youths in municipal affairs, I would like to give an example of interns in Mazar-e-Sharif Municipality. In my earlier capacity as manager of municipal component of ASG-P, we worked on partnership building between universities and municipalities. In this connection, we developed a memorandum of understanding and got it signed between universities and municipalities in around 10 cities. The memorandum was for three basic purposes: 1) University-Municipal Committee; student-led municipal administration in university; 2) Internship and 3) Research and Development.

Specifically talking about the internship, the memorandum stipulated that the university will allocate 10 to 15 marks in each semester for the practicum in municipalities in different aspects based on students’ field of study. As an entry point, in Mazar-e-Sharif we were able to put interns in three departments: Construction, Planning and Cultural Affairs for some months on voluntary service. As it was introduced last year, it requires more follow up to generate better results. New practice takes time and requires efforts to institutionalize. The best thing is the receptiveness of both parties of the memorandum for this work. The benefit is mutual; the municipalities will have access to young professionals and this way supplement the human resource and the university will equip students with practical skills before their graduation to help them be ready to apply the theories they have been educated on. Moreover, it grants the interns with a certificate of practice or experience in the municipality to help them compete better in recruitment processes. Currently, lack of experience is a big challenge pushing young professionals behind from good jobs.

I fully support Mr. Hamidullah Afghan’s idea of moving this agenda forward with the Ministry of Higher Education to apply this model nationwide and allocate specific marks for engagement in urban activities.

Under the third component of the memorandum “Research and Development”, we wanted to bring university professors closer to the municipality for research and capacity development of municipal staff through seminars and conferences. We also expected that universities start to focus projects and students’ assignments on urban issues and come along with proposals. And we made it by mobilizing students of the engineering faculty to work on city roads project in Mazar-e-Sharif as their class assignment.

Eng. Mohammad Latif Muzafarkhil, Afghan Urban Water Supply and Sewerage Corporation, Kabul

An advice and experience on promoting citizen engagement.

یوه مشوره او تجربه د بیاریانو ونئی اخیستنی د زياتندو ههکله.

باور و تجریه من داه برای پشت که برای سهیم سالی شهروندان همه به راهیره های متفاوت متوسل شد.
(1) اموجنی از مردم، اموجنی دنی از مردم و عمل کردن به مشترکت مردم (2) ایجاد احساس مالکیت طوری که در شورا های قربه از طریق همسنجی ملی صورت میگیرد (3) مشوره با صاحب نظارت.

مشوره در افغانستان نکات متینت و منفی دارد، نکته مثبت اینکه ما در یکی از بروده ها به مسئلات مالی مواجه گردیم و به تنهایی قادر به تکمیل آن نیستیم. از طریق برگه از مردم ارتباط یافتنی و موفق شدن تا بروده را به یاده اکمال بررسی. این کار طوری صورت گرفت که ما وضعیت را به صراحی یاد کرده و پس از توافق، همه موانع لازم را که در اختیار داشتنی به ایالتی و اکثریت تمایلی آنرا مردم با سهمگیری
Gozar and Nahia organizations and accountability programs. Alhaj Mohammad Salim Taraki, Herat Municipality, Herat. Looking to discuss it further and contribute to the process.

Further to Mr. Zubair Fattahi’s response, I really do support targeting the key reform that is the base and critical step toward de-concentration practices in bringing public sector closer to the people.

In addition, given the importance of this reform, and understanding of the current confusion and ambiguity how to make this reform practically happening in the context of Afghanistan requires a lot of debate and clarity building. Though we have the local planning and budgeting part of the TMAL, but from my understanding and the result of debates with Ministry of Finance (MoF) and Ministry of Economy (MoEc), it does not seem to be seen as a process that is inclusive and practical. An inclusive process would cover all aspects of the reform process; local planning and role of local entities, budget ceiling and the role of MoF and MoEc and IDLG, local participation and accountability - role and interaction between the local councils and executive bodies and importantly legal support framework, capacity and system building.

So for introducing planning in the area of municipalities or the broader planning and budgeting practice at the provincial level, my advice would be to introduce the debate needed for clarity building and determination of the way-forward. Such networks of local governance practitioners can be the catalyst for making the right and practical changes and reforms happening.

I am also happy to share two very recent and interesting papers from LSE’s Asia Research Center on local governance reforms that also include issues around municipalities. One is “Should China Revisit the 1994 Fiscal Reforms?”, available at http://www2.lse.ac.uk/asiaResearchCentre/_files/ARCWP52-Ahmad.pdf [PDF, Size: 790 KB]. The other is, “Financing Social Policy in the Presence of Informality”, at http://www2.lse.ac.uk/asiaResearchCentre/_files/ARCWP54-AhmadBest.pdf [PDF, Size: 903 KB] Will be looking to discuss it further and contribute to the process.

Further to Mr. Zubair Fattahi’s response, I really do support targeting the key reform that is the base and critical step toward de-concentration practices in bringing public sector closer to the people.

In addition, given the importance of this reform, and understanding of the current confusion and ambiguity how to make this reform practically happening in the context of Afghanistan requires a lot of debate and clarity building. Though we have the local planning and budgeting part of the TMAL, but from my understanding and the result of debates with Ministry of Finance (MoF) and Ministry of Economy (MoEc), it does not seem to be seen as a process that is inclusive and practical. An inclusive process would cover all aspects of the reform process; local planning and role of local entities, budget ceiling and the role of MoF and MoEc and IDLG, local participation and accountability - role and interaction between the local councils and executive bodies and importantly legal support framework, capacity and system building.

So for introducing planning in the area of municipalities or the broader planning and budgeting practice at the provincial level, my advice would be to introduce the debate needed for clarity building and determination of the way-forward. Such networks of local governance practitioners can be the catalyst for making the right and practical changes and reforms happening.

I am also happy to share two very recent and interesting papers from LSE’s Asia Research Center on local governance reforms that also include issues around municipalities. One is “Should China Revisit the 1994 Fiscal Reforms?”, available at http://www2.lse.ac.uk/asiaResearchCentre/_files/ARCWP52-Ahmad.pdf [PDF, Size: 790 KB]. The other is, “Financing Social Policy in the Presence of Informality”, at http://www2.lse.ac.uk/asiaResearchCentre/_files/ARCWP54-AhmadBest.pdf [PDF, Size: 903 KB] Will be looking to discuss it further and contribute to the process.

Further to Mr. Zubair Fattahi’s response, I really do support targeting the key reform that is the base and critical step toward de-concentration practices in bringing public sector closer to the people.

In addition, given the importance of this reform, and understanding of the current confusion and ambiguity how to make this reform practically happening in the context of Afghanistan requires a lot of debate and clarity building. Though we have the local planning and budgeting part of the TMAL, but from my understanding and the result of debates with Ministry of Finance (MoF) and Ministry of Economy (MoEc), it does not seem to be seen as a process that is inclusive and practical. An inclusive process would cover all aspects of the reform process; local planning and role of local entities, budget ceiling and the role of MoF and MoEc and IDLG, local participation and accountability - role and interaction between the local councils and executive bodies and importantly legal support framework, capacity and system building.

So for introducing planning in the area of municipalities or the broader planning and budgeting practice at the provincial level, my advice would be to introduce the debate needed for clarity building and determination of the way-forward. Such networks of local governance practitioners can be the catalyst for making the right and practical changes and reforms happening.

I am also happy to share two very recent and interesting papers from LSE’s Asia Research Center on local governance reforms that also include issues around municipalities. One is “Should China Revisit the 1994 Fiscal Reforms?”, available at http://www2.lse.ac.uk/asiaResearchCentre/_files/ARCWP52-Ahmad.pdf [PDF, Size: 790 KB]. The other is, “Financing Social Policy in the Presence of Informality”, at http://www2.lse.ac.uk/asiaResearchCentre/_files/ARCWP54-AhmadBest.pdf [PDF, Size: 903 KB] Will be looking to discuss it further and contribute to the process.

Further to Mr. Zubair Fattahi’s response, I really do support targeting the key reform that is the base and critical step toward de-concentration practices in bringing public sector closer to the people.

In addition, given the importance of this reform, and understanding of the current confusion and ambiguity how to make this reform practically happening in the context of Afghanistan requires a lot of debate and clarity building. Though we have the local planning and budgeting part of the TMAL, but from my understanding and the result of debates with Ministry of Finance (MoF) and Ministry of Economy (MoEc), it does not seem to be seen as a process that is inclusive and practical. An inclusive process would cover all aspects of the reform process; local planning and role of local entities, budget ceiling and the role of MoF and MoEc and IDLG, local participation and accountability - role and interaction between the local councils and executive bodies and importantly legal support framework, capacity and system building.

So for introducing planning in the area of municipalities or the broader planning and budgeting practice at the provincial level, my advice would be to introduce the debate needed for clarity building and determination of the way-forward. Such networks of local governance practitioners can be the catalyst for making the right and practical changes and reforms happening.

I am also happy to share two very recent and interesting papers from LSE’s Asia Research Center on local governance reforms that also include issues around municipalities. One is “Should China Revisit the 1994 Fiscal Reforms?”, available at http://www2.lse.ac.uk/asiaResearchCentre/_files/ARCWP52-Ahmad.pdf [PDF, Size: 790 KB]. The other is, “Financing Social Policy in the Presence of Informality”, at http://www2.lse.ac.uk/asiaResearchCentre/_files/ARCWP54-AhmadBest.pdf [PDF, Size: 903 KB] Will be looking to discuss it further and contribute to the process.
شرابینه نهاد های مردمی اند و اراده مردم در امور شاروالیها حاکم می باشد. بروفق این اصل و بمنظور تحقق حکومتداری خوب، شاروالی هرات بیشتر سعی وربرد تا هر موردی با ساختار های مختلف در خانه حکومتی و اکتشاف شهری سهیم سازد. برخی از دستاوردها در عرصه سهیم سازی شهروندان را مثال گوته می شمارند.

1. بورد علمی مشورتی:

در سطح شهر یک بورد مشورتی علمی داریم که توسط کادر های علمی، فرهنگی، مدپوش، سکتور خصوصی و ادارات سیاسی تشکیل می شود. این بورد در مبنای نظرات و هماهنگی نهاد های مختلف شاروالیهای محلی می باشد.

2. نشریات و برنامه های رادیویی و تلویزیونی:

طرح همکاری اتاق بازاریابی مشترک یکی از اهداف شاروالی هرات است. این برنامه در شکل شهری می گردد و اطلاعات مربوط به امور مختلف را با مشارکت تعدادی از شهروندان منتشر می کند.

3. وب سایت:

شاروالی هرات با مبتنی بر افتخار دسترسی محتوای مختلف شاروالی هرات را به همراه ارائه می کند. این وب سایت شامل موارد مختلفی مانند اخبار، برنامه های رادیویی و تلویزیونی، برنامه های اجتماعی و فرهنگی است.

4. برگزاری جشنواره ها:

برگزاری جشنواره هایی در زمینه فیلم سازی، هنر و هنرمندی که موجب بهبود کیفیت حاکمیتی و ارتباط عمومی می گردد.

5. کمیته ها:

در هرات فعال 10 کمیته شاروالی در مکتوبات و 1 کمیته در سطح شهرداری و بازی امور اکتشاف اقتصادی یک کمیته اکتشاف اقتصادی. با این کمیته ها، موفقیت و اجرای برنامه های مختلف و ایجاد فرصت های کسب و کار در شاروالی هرات امکان پذیر است.
شهروندان در قبال شهر و جامعه شدید است. از جانب دیگر، آشنایی متعلمین با روند انتخاب شاروالی و سرانجام تعیین شاروالان منتخب در مکاتب منجر به اجرای بعضی فعالیت‌های محلی و سگرخواری رشد قدرت های شعله و سرآرامی و نیز بهبود بهداشت عمومی سطح مکاتب شده و توجه به حفاظت محیط زیست را افزایش داده است. این حرکت را در ترویج فرهنگ بهتر شهرنشینی خیلی موثر می‌دانیم.

تلاش‌ها و سیاست‌های اقتصادی بهبودی در زمینه‌هایی مانند: تامین مالی بهبود و درمانگاهی در مکاتب، کمک به جمع بندی مشتری و بهبود سطح مکاتب، کاهش میزان سوء استفاده از کمک‌های مالی و افزایش حمایت مالی از شهروندان، و بهبود وضعیت اقتصادی و سطح حیاتی شهروندان، منجر به تسریع در تحقق اهداف و بهبود نهایی می‌شود.

کمیته‌های انکشاف اقتصادی، بستری پیوستگی و ایجاد روابط صنعتی را فراهم کردیم. از این طریق، موفقیت‌ها و نتایج‌ها را در شرایط فعلی و موجود در این زمینه با کمک‌های منابع مختلف، بهبود و راهکار‌های جدیدی ارائه می‌دهیم. این حرکت را در ترویج فرهنگ بهتر شهرنشینی خیلی موثر می‌دانیم.

در کمیته انکشاف اقتصادی، بستری پیوستگی و ایجاد روابط صنعتی را فراهم کردیم. از این طریق، موفقیت‌ها و نتایج‌ها را در شرایط فعلی و موجود در این زمینه با کمک‌های منابع مختلف، بهبود و راهکار‌های جدیدی ارائه می‌دهیم. این حرکت را در ترویج فرهنگ بهتر شهرنشینی خیلی موثر می‌دانیم.

کارکرد این کمیته‌ها همیشه موثر و بیشتر گردید. این کمیته‌ها جامعه شهروندان را در موضوعات مختلف مطابق با نیازهای منطقه‌ای و شهری انجام می‌دهند و مسئولان بهبودی در زمینه‌های مختلف را تأمین می‌کنند.

تمامی این اقدامات بهبودی در سطح شهر و نواحی را منظماً برگزار می‌کنند. این کمیته‌ها جامعه شهروندان را در موضوعات مختلف مطابق با نیازهای منطقه‌ای و شهری انجام می‌دهند و مسئولان بهبودی در سطح شهر و نواحی را منظماً برگزار می‌کنند.
transmit the information contained in these messages should be aware that they are relying on their own judgment.

Copyrighted under Creative Commons License "Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0". Re-users of this material must cite as their source Solution Exchange as well as the item’s recommender, if relevant, and must share any derivative work with the Solution Exchange Community.

Solution Exchange is a UN initiative for development practitioners in Afghanistan. For more information please visit http://www.solutionexchange-un.net/afghanistan
مجمع حکومتداری و انکشاف شهری
باستگی توحیدی

سوال: مشارکت وسهمی سازی شهرسازان در حکومتداری شهری

تعداد

گردآوری توسط
محمد نصر حمیدی، تسهیل کننده و
نعمت الله حیدری، کارشناس تحقیق و
وزیر...

تاریخ نشر: 07 جنوری 2013

از طرف محترم
عبدالباقی پوپل، رئیس عمومی امور شاروالی ها، اداره مستقل
ارگان های محلی

تاریخ نشر سوال 11 دسامبر 2012

اداره مستقل ارکان های محلی بر علاوه سایر وظایف کلیدی خویش، مستندات شاروالی های ولایتی و ولسوالی ها را عهده دار است. به صفت رئیس عمومی امور شاروالی ها در اداره مستقل ارکان های محلی، افتتاح مجمع ویژه حکومتداری و انکشاف شهری در چارچوب برنامه تبادل راه حل های افغانستان را سند داده و بر اساس این برنامه می‌توان به‌عنوان اولین مجمع ویژه حکومتداری و انکشاف شهری، افتتاح شود. این مجمع با هدف مصاحبه با متخصصین و متغیران امور شهری به منظور دستیابی به راه حل‌های عملی برای مسائل شهری می‌باشد. برای این‌که راه حل‌های اینکاری عادی برود که به‌عنوان یکی از اهداف این مجمع افتخار و شناخت و نظارت و برنامه ریزی می‌گردد.

از طرف محققان مورد حمایت برای اولین بار به نظامی و اداره مستقل ارکان های محلی، ارسال سوال را به اعضای مجمع اداره ارسال می‌نماید تا به دنبال دیدگاه‌های تامین داشته باشد. این سوال به‌عنوان نمونه‌ای از مسائل مهم بررسی و پیوسته می‌گردد.

یکی از نقش‌های مهم اداره مستقل ارکان های محلی در اداره مستقل ارکان های محلی، کار روز مقرر، لویحی، طراحی و برنامه‌ریزی موثر و بهینه‌سازی موثر به‌عنوان اجزای اصلی این هدف است. انتظار می‌رود که این مجمع، مشارکت ودنیا در حکومتداری شهری یک موضوع مهم جهت حصول اطلاعاتی از سوی اطلاعات در شوراهای اسلامی، باید داشته باشد. این مجمع می‌تواند به تشکیل بخش‌های مربوط به امور سازگاری، شرایط جامعه، مسائل اقتصادی، سیاست‌های ملی و دیگر موضوعات مرتبط با جهت‌گیری مشارکت شرکت‌کنندگان در این مجمع باشد.

در صورت اگاهی، پیشنهاد عمومی امور شاروالی ها از راهکارهای که مطرح کاهش جهت افزایش مشارکت شرکت‌کنندگان در ساختار فوکال، این هدف‌ها می‌تواند می‌تواند به‌عنوان یکی از امکان‌های جزء بایستی و مفید‌ترین که برای طرح اداره شاروالی ها تدوین می‌تواند، یا اینکه بر می‌گردد که این‌ها را تدوین کنند.
به‌دین منظور، از کسانی که در شاروالی‌های افغانستان، یا جاهای دیگر، کار می‌کنند، نگاهی دارم تا مثال‌های خوبی در حوزه حکومت‌داری شهری را ارائه دهند و به‌عنوان مثال‌هایی برای جمع‌آوری و انتخاب شرکت‌کنند. در این زمینه، چه موفقیت‌هایی دارید؟ چه مشکلاتی را داشته‌اید و در این زمینه چه تجربیاتی داشته‌اید؟

خلاصه جوابات

در اولین سوال مجمع از جانب رئیس عمومی امور شاروالی‌ها، تجربه اعضای در مورد "مشارکت شهروندان در حکومت‌داری شهری" خواسته گردید. در نتیجه، ۲۵ تن از اعضای مجمع، تجربه‌های خود را ارائه دادند. بعضی از این تجربیات از جمله تجربیات داخل افغانستان، از طریق برنامه‌های مطرحی که توسط خریداران حمایت می‌شود، مانند ASGP که توسط دفتر UNDP و RAMP-UP که توسط USAID کمک می‌شود. ولی در عین حال، تجربیات بین‌المللی نیز به عنوان این نشانه شد که نقش سهیم‌سازی شهروندان را برجسته نموده که ارزش تشریح دانش را فراتر از راه‌های موجودِ در دسترس حکومت تسجیل می‌نماید.

بررسی‌های مشورتی دهنده

پروسه‌های مشورتی دهندگان موارد بسیار خوبی از حکومت‌های شهری که با شهروندان خود در امور پلان‌گذاری، قانون‌سازی، پالیسی‌سازی و پروسه‌های بودجه‌سازی مشوره می‌نمودند، شریک ساختند. بعضی از این تجربیات در مورد شرکت‌کردن شهروندان در امور بازبینی بودجه و جلسات استماع بودجه در شاروالی‌های شمالی و شمال‌شرقی افغانستان، شکل گرفته که در مورد مثالی از این جلسات، تعدادی از شهروندان شرکت کردند. در هرند، جلسات استماع، انجمن‌های پاسخگویی و برخی از نهادهای جامعه‌ای در افغانستان نیز به این تجربیات اشاره کردند.

برداشت‌ها و تجربیات

برداشت‌ها و تجربیات شهروندان از حوزه حکومت‌داری شهری در افغانستان، یکی از اهدافی است که برای آنها تعریف شده است. این تجربیات مشاهداتی از انجام تحقیقات و پژوهش‌های مختلف می‌باشند که تأکید دارند که نقش شهروندان در حکومت‌داری شهری بسیار مهم است.

نتایج

نتایج این تحقیق نشان داد که شهروندان به عنوان شرکت‌کنندگان در حکومت‌داری شهری، باعث بهبود در کیفیت خدمات حکومتی می‌شوند. این تجربیات نیز نشان داد که نقش شهروندان در حکومت‌داری شهری می‌تواند به بهبود کیفیت خدمات حکومتی می‌رساند.
برعلاوه بر موارد سه گانه فوق، باشخ دهندگان موضوعات دیگری را نیز پیش نوادند. در هرات، مزارشریف و قندوز آموزش شهروندی و مسئولیت سیاسی شهری را از طریق سیستم امورمندی در حال ایجاد ساختار حاکمیتی توسط شاگردان و کیفرده سه گانه فوق، جامعه نماینده مشارکتی در آسیا (PRIA) مسئولیت و حکومتداری جامعه‌اش را از طریق ایجاد ساختار حاکمیتی در ساختمان‌های عمومی و سیستم‌های تعیین نشان داده، از طریق سیستم‌های ترغیب‌ناهید و متأسفانه رویکردهای جنگی گوناگونی که باعث جمع‌آوری اطلاعات خانه‌ای به حساب رفته بود، به منظور ترویج این ابزار تحلیلی ای را پیشنهاد دادند که عبارت بود از 10 عنصر خاص "پویایی قدرت و حکومتداری جامعه" که از سالهای 90 فیلیپین به منصبه اجراء شد. با تمرکز بر این ابزار، اعضای جامعه تحقیقی مشارکتی در آسیا (PRIA) مثبت و آگاهی شهروندان در سایه رأی‌گیری، ثبت تولدات، دسترسی به فضاهای شهری و دیگر مسائل کمپین می‌کردند. یکی از پاسخ‌دهندگان ابتکار جمع آوری کثافات خانه بازمانده بود که بعداً شاروالی به عنوان الگو استفاده‌کرد. بهترین فکرهای مردمی ایستاده بودند از جمله: شفافیت و توقف، حکومتداری بهتر، و ترویج الگوسازی رفتاری را به عنوان ابزار موثری برای ترویج "تدوین" نام بردند و مثال‌هایی درین رابطه از جنجنو، هندوستان که ابتکار جمع آوری کثافات خانه به منظور جمع‌آوری و آگاهی کودکان و نازل‌ها مطرح شده بود در این مورد استفاده کردند. این نکته به یک چالش بزرگ تر که عبارت از ایجاد شفافیت و پاسخگویی و موثریت در اجرای طرزالعمل های شاروالی‌ها است، برمی‌گردد.

zial shahyay jomhoda. yeki az masaeli eshara sheyeh ovari budo az managheh avognidada mowad nia taray bigayi yeki az masaeli eshara sheyeh ovari budo az managheh avognidada mowad nia taray bigayi yeki az masaeli eshara sheyeh ovari budo az managheh avognidada mowad nia taray bigayi yeki az masaeli eshara sheyeh ovari budo az managheh avognidada mowad nia taray bigayi yeki az masaeli eshara sheyeh ovari budo az managheh avognidada mowad nia taray bigayi yeki az masaeli eshara sheyeh ovari budo az managheh avognidada mowad nia taray bigayi yek
د شاری حکومتیال او پرخاجتیا تولیه
توحیدی خوااب

پوښتنه: د سراری گڼون یو شاری حکومتیالی ڼی - یادی

توجه کړی:
محمد نصر حمیدی، اساتید براپرتوکی او فهمت له جنوبی، د خریدی ڼاره
د خریدو ڼیه: 27 جنوری 2013

د شاغلی عبدالباقی یوبول، د سیمه پيزو اورگانون خیلواکه اداره، د سراری ڼی
ریاست لوی رئیس لخواه.

د لپید 11 دسمبر 2012

د سیمه پيزو اورگانون خیلواکه اداره بر سیره بر خیل خانگو یو غاړی، دی د سیمه پيزو اورگانون خیلواکه اداره د سراری ڼی ریاست لوی رئیس یه
حکومتیالی. دنده بر غاره ڼیه. د سیمه پيزو اورگانون خیلواکه اداره د سراری ڼی ریاست لوی رئیس یه
توکه وارم جه دیشانی حکومتیالی او پرخاجتیا تولیه برائینستیل گڼی. د سراری حکومتیالی او پرخاجتیا تولیه
له لاری کولی کیو د تجربه لرونکو او کاروهانو سرمه یاریکه تینکه ڼیه. د حل لاریوړالیه برورگرام یو دیعالي
توانت د چه به خانگی دولت او افغانستان ارینی یوهی د ګنعتال او بدلون بریسه او همداریه زمون
کونونو د سیمری حکومتیالی او ملی لریونیونیه برورگرام یکی دیشانی ۍر
پرخاجتیا تولیه.

سره مرسه کیو.

یه سیره بر دی ژن خوس یم چه له مرنی پوښته ین د دولتی غری یه ته استریم ژر سیاستی لورید
د هغو
مهمو کرن چه د سیمه پيزو خیلواکه اورگانون د سراری ڼی ریاست. دلسره مهی خه ده ګورو.

د سیمه پيزو خیلواکه اداره مهم زمل. د مقرانتوهه به موخه ګڼ کول. لوبی، ۴ن یاری، لازمنیه د ملی
لومریونو دیروگرامتونو کورتیا ننیفیسکی به موخه یکی. موټر ییکې بیا یو چی د سیکل سراری ڼی ګردن به سراری
حکومتیالی. یکی ده مهم موسیقی د لامینی د اړمنی ده موخته، ویه لاسته راول.
یه شیاته یکی دیروگرامتونو کورتیا به موخه یکی. د سراری ڼی ګردن ده که کی یه مختلف دولت
په مجوړی بروی، یکی دیشانی حکومتیالی، یکی دیشانی حکومتیالی، یکی دیشانی حکومتیالی، یکی دیشانی حکومتیالی.
له هغو دیروجارو
خجې د سراری ڼی ګردن ده عمومی ریاست د خپلو یه صورته یه دی کی د کار په یوه لاسی دی سیمو کی د سراری یو د
گرون ریزمنیه لیاره کارولی. موټر یه دای راوکی لیه لیاره ده یونه بالیسو او مفرزاتو برخه و ګرکه
چې د سراری ۍکه دکرون لاره لیاره ییه دمتو کوره یا دا چې ویژن شیوه په په یوه دوکه دکرونی دنی چې دگه.

له همدي امله، له هغو دکریو خجې یه دافغانستان د سراری ڼی او یو د دیشانی ڼی ده تر سره یکی
هله لر ېنم یه سراری حکومتیالی. یکی د کونون دی لګنکه له ما او د دیشانی حکومتیالی. یکی د دیشانی ڼی
نورو ملګرو سرمه ښریک ګریدی. بیړ ییه یکه تجربه ښتون لرکی؟ دغه تجربه له خان سره خه بیراڼچه لری
او محدودیتوهه په خه دی دو خو یوولي چې دی په البومیاو یو یو وئرمه او مقدارام ښتون کنی ټوله له لاسه رضی او لری.
جمهوریت اسلامی هندوستان

جامعه ورزشی برویه یا نظارت در آن

همواره خدمات مشوره کردن

دلیل مسئولیت د او له من. په هکله د ن

ملاحظه ورشکسته وکلته او حکومت له، مثالونه د ویلذه وکونه، په هندوستان

منظوره هم پک مهال، نور نور چندندی

د اشتراکی حکمرانی د پلاژیوره لیاره

چته وکونه یا مسئولیت بی پر غاره اخلاقی، لکه له مارشال کی د هرلول ولیاره او شماره پرایرسپاری

کی للیته برکری بیدلی ترمسحده خونر نور برادر شوی ملیلونه چی د پرگرشت نوره کی لیاره چک د

پاکستان د کارامی گیم کی په هلوله سهیم کی د لیاره پوری اورن. په "تخنیکی جارو چې ور وژ معلومات اتاره اصلی خدمات ولایتی چوی. د نیلگوله، هندهستون او

مارشالیکی فوهری نوپورولو سپارندی به ساپوره سپارنی خدمات مشترکه کول. یو گډولو یا پاکستان به کرکی کی د یو شته ماله به یو ترمن. چی د نارولی موسمی لخوا سنولبدینکی تولنه ده. به نور د ملیلون کی چی یادونه په وړل. د هندهستون یا راجستن، چینسکور او وی او د خلچه ورابوله. به قرآن کی د کسپ دربوازی لیاره د مشترکه یوک لمبیکی او به هر ایلکی په هیکی شمله او

خپل خونر د اشتراکی اقتصادی برمخته کیوب. یو سرپرست دی غیر کنوره، خوان ریازکی هر دولتی یا کیند. له تولنیزی

summary معلومات ارتوکوله ارزوی شوی، او د هدیهستان د چن جنوب. د په سیاسي بیاونه په یوک وکر کی جن هله

4 Citizen Report Card

5 The Society of Participatory Research in Asia (PRIA)
د پلارالي نظم عموم، له نزلاهی شیو تجویز خمه دا پابلی نزلاهی شوه چی د هقلو سیکلتیا هیمه مهال تیرولو برینالی وي چې چې د کله سیاروالیان د نیار اوسپیدونکو سره یا نیژه کی کیدو او د خپرو له لاری هغه، فعالی برخی اخیستیته نه هخوی، نو دا چاره د دیپار د اوسپیدونکو تهایه یه یولونیزړو جارو کی لوری، د نیار تیرولو دچی بیدونه یې موجوم په شفافیت کې چې بلابلا ته ښنی او له شهی امکانونه استفاده کوي له ملی متابع، خوانن شهویې او د دیپار د اوسپیدونکو گرون یه یولیزو جارو کی چې چې یوه سیکلتیا یې زیاته شی، بلاخره سپارالی د نیار اوسپیدونکی یه یولونیزړو چې د ناشتوالینو او نیار اوسپیدونکو ته یوه، نظارت او یه مسئولیتونه کې د سیکلتیا چاره ده. چې یه هره برخه کی برینالی نزلاهی شوه، له چې د چاره هم دی یولی کولو فرصتو او پر گرو دوامداه نظر ورکول او د یولی لیاره کی یون یارین. یوې گدونول له نیروالی تولی د غونئی گیبون 6 غونئیتو وړه، چې د عامه سیکلتیا نمونه یې جوړه که چې د گدون همکاری یاری پیلو یکاردنیو یې کوله.

ستونی، یو موضع چې یادونه یې وښه، د سرژینو او هغه هلول خله چې د نیار د اوسپیدونکو دایمی سیکلتیا د سیاتالیلو لیاره ارنیته 56، ده چې خانگنی دون یې هوهای یې چې یینیوالی چې هرده اوس ورسه ذبیر سپارالی مهاله. د چې د یولیزړو یه یوه هغو کیدو نیار مسئولیتونه د هغو یولیزړو له راکمولو کی مرسته کوی چې غیر ممبایی دیاچونکه له امله رامخته کیري. اریکی او ارتباط او انټریت له نیار مسئولیتونه ده امله کیده یې یکی شی، د چې د نیار د اوسپیدونکو د سیکلتیا به برخه کې د قواعد او لارنیووو د نیار مسئولیتونه له امله غازیلی نیاره. دغه د ندرکمه شونه، دغه ورسوتو کې د دیپارالی لیاره د عمبابی بروښیرونو یې شفافیت د رامخته کولو، مسئولیتونه او/أو اغوریفتیا لیاره به هغه برخه مشکل یاره لری.

له پراغو اصلیه هغو سره د لیاریا زبانیدل، د اوسپیدونکو د سیکلتیا اه منظم پابلی دلایه کی. یې دی کی مختلف ترسره شوی ورامینوو شامیلیدا چې یې له دیپارلی اوسپیدونکی د مشارو رسمی کیدل د (د کور نسلیکه، د سپارالی د مشوارت یوی دې) د یوې جریه یو لیاره یې بېهی ولری ورت سیکلتیا او د عمبابی اقاداتمه به برخه کې د نیار لارو هغه کول.

له پراغو شوی مسئولوونه خمه دا انداده کیدای شینه چې یې افغانستان او نورو خایتو کې د نیار د اوسپیدونکو د نسل سیکلتیا لیاره دی فرضونه شته، چې پراغو پابلی رامخته کیدی، چې چې سیکلتیا شفافیت او چې غیر ممبایی هغه کې پر نیار لارو، غړه یې غوښتنیو یې اوسپیدونکی د غوښتنیو سیکلتیا انټریتی، او دا چې ایا یا یې د عامل شپاروالی مصرف د پرمختلی خارنی، د دیپار ازمانه خدمتو او/أو پاکوی پاگوی کې له لاری را کې یې او/أو؟

6 International Association for Public Participation